Fostering learning and democratic citizenship through the polyphonic and dialogic classroom

Olga Dysthe

Department of Education, University of Bergen, Norway

ECNAIS, Sofia, Bulgaria Nov 19. 2015
Survey of content

Introduction

I. Theory basis:
   I. View of learning, important concepts
   II. Different conceptions of dialogue, with a focus on Bakhtin

II. How to create a polyphonic classroom
   3 important arenas:
      1. Teacher led dialogic interaction in classrooms
      2. Student led groups in different subjects
      3. Writing and dialogic feedback

Conclusion

Dysthe 2015
Functions of education (Gert Biesta)

- **Qualification**: knowledge, skills and attitudes that will either qualify students to do something, specifically in the manner of a profession or be applied in a more general sense throughout the course of a lifetime.

- **Socialization**: how individuals become part of the existing socio-cultural, political and moral order
  - Directly through the content
  - Indirectly "work methods, norms and values that are validated"

- **Subjectification (individualization)**: how the individual is given the opportunity to develop as a unique, distinctive, independent and responsible human being.

- NB The three functions are intertwined

Dysthe 2015
A new (?) concern for educators

- How to prevent radicalization of young people?
- How to foster democratic citizenship?

Biesta & Lawry (2006): move from *learning about* democracy to learning democratic citizenship as *practice*
  - Identification with public issues of common concern
  - Creating a culture of participation, dialogue & deliberation

My claim: in polyphonic classrooms where pupils get used to participate and dialogue and where their voices are being heard, they develop a defence against undemocratic ideas and practices (Biesta: Work methods, norms & values in classroom)

"BILDUNG"

SYSTEMATIC WORK OVER LONG TIME!

Dysthe 2015
From an interview Nov 16th with a Bergen professor of education in the aftermath of the Paris terrorist attacks

"Pedagogy today does not deal with important topics on a deeper level of human life, like sorrow and fear. ...In school we need to build opp a cognitive and emotional capacity strong enough to deal with the fear that such attacks as those in Paris create.

We also need to cultivate a language to talk about the boredom many young people feel, their experience of being on the outside of society and not having any responsibility towards the state or society. These feelings are an enormous destructive force. The future of democracy is dependent on how well we are able to identify and meet the angry, disappointed losers in our communities”

VÅRT LAND , Nov 16th 2015

Dysthe 2015
Theoretical view of learning – important concepts
Learning

Two definitions of learning:

• «Learning means acquisition and modification of knowledge, skills, strategies, attitude and behaviour» (Schunck, 2000).

*The main tradition in learning theory is individualistic

• «Learning means to master activities, actions and linguistic discourses within a community» (Lave & Wenger, 1991).

Sociocultural theory emphasize the community
Two metaphors of learning (Sfard 1998)

- **Aquisition**
  - Learning as individual gain (have/own/possess knowledge)
  - Transmission of knowledge
  - Learner as receiver of knowledge
  - Teacher as informer, lecturer, helper

- **Participation**
  - Community building (belong, communicate)
  - Become a participant
  - Learner as apprentice
  - Teacher as expert participant, supervisor in collaboration, process and communication

*Sfard’s point: we need both metaphors*

Dysthe 2015
Community

Z. Baumann (2000) *Lost community*

- Basic concepts: safety and freedom
- Individuality can only be understood in relation to community
- Community is given meaning through the individual
- Autonomy and order are preconditions for each other

"Social processes in general og productive work in particular must be led and cannot be left to its own drive” (p. 37)

GOOD LEADERSHIP OF CLASSROOM LEARNING IS ALFA AND OMEGA

Dysthe 2015
'Polyphony' (multivoicedness)

Mikhail Bakhtin, Russian theoretician of language, literature and culture
‘voice’: the speaking personality
‘heteroglossia’: individual voices are formed by the language in different social groups (region, age, occupation)
‘polyfony’ many voices in music, none dominates:
’the polyphonic novel’ (Dostoevskij)

A school class is always polyphonic or multivoiced in the sense that it has many voices: pupils with different background, culture, experiences, abilities, knowledge ...

Challenge: To use polyphony as a resource for learning

Dysthe 2015
What characterizes a ‘polyphonic classroom’?

It is where every child or young person
• is in dialogue and interaction with others
• is a participant
• is seen and heard
• is engaged
• is given a voice
• has respect for other, different voices
• has professional self confidence
• learns to express oneself in writing, talking, and by using practical & esthetic means
• develops the urge and the ability to learn more + +

Is the polyphonic learning community part of your school’s vision? Which points do you find most important? Why?

Dysthe 2015
The polyphonic classroom depends on dialogue

- **Between persons** (external dialogue)
  *Oral* dialogue
  Pupil-pupil, pupil-teacher
  Written dialogue

- **Between persons and text** (internal)
  with textbook, lecture, picture etc

- **Between texts** (intertextuality)

Dysthe 2015
«School of Dialogue of Cultures Pedagogical Movement» in Ukraine & Russia

• Started by philosophers and teachers 1990ies
• Goal: to involve pupils in dialogue in all subjects in elem. school, with the great cultures and thinkers of the past in sec.
• Theoretical background:
  – Theoretical ideas about children’s cognitive development as mirror of the development of cultures
  – Hegel, Bakhtin, Bibler
• Practice: i.e. «History of World Culture» course, Ochag Gymnasium, Kharkov, Ukraine. «A holistic dialogic course in the humanities» 6-11 gr


Dysthe 2015
Different theoretical conceptions of dialogue

- **Every day language**: face to face conversation
  Ideal: based on equality, reciprocity, and trust
- **Platon/Sokrates**: argumentation free of power
  – The Socratic conversation as pedagogic ideal?
- **Buber**: focus on relations (I-you) and the meeting with “the Other”
- **Habermas**: content-and consensus oriented:
  “Discusive ethics”- “the best argument wins”
- **Freire**: instrument for political liberation
- **Bakhtin**: meaning and understanding is created through interaction: when different voices confront each other

Dysthe 2015
BAKHTIN’s view of dialogue (my understanding)

Three aspects

I: Ontological: Dialogue is the fundamental principle in life
   – «Life is dialogic in its nature» (Bakhtin 1979: 113) basis of human existence
   – “to live means to participate in dialogue: to ask, listen, answer, argue and so on” (Voloshinov/Bakhtin 1973:318)
   – the relationship between me and ”the other” (agree with Buber)

II. Epistemological: Meaning and understanding is created through dialogue
   • “a bridge between the speaker and listener, writer and reader”
   • “a spark between two poles”
   – Confrontation between voices

III. Dialogue as opposition to monologue
    where there is no room for questions and doubt)
An existential view of dialogue  
Buber & Bakhtin

To place dialogue in the centre of human existence has consequences for what fundamental values set their mark on the community in a kindergarten, a school, and a home

For instance:

What value do we place on building relations?
- How to foster trust, mutual respect and seeing the other?

THE TEACHER AS MODEL

Creating good relations in the classroom is a prerequisite for dialogue

Dysthe 2015
Bakhtin’s dialogic model of communication
(How meaning and knowledge is created)

The traditional model is monologic
   Sender - Message – Recipient
• Has dominated classroom teaching for ages: that pupils learn when teachers talk
Bakhtin:
   We create meaning – knowledge (learning)
• “the listener becomes a co-producer of meaning”
• “use each other’s word as a thinking tool” (Lotman)
• Most productive when different voices confront each other

What model dominates in classrooms in your school?
Dysthe 2015
Difference and disagreement: important for learning

Bakhtins theory: It is not enough that different voices exist. It is the differences, divergences and tension between them that create opportunity for a deeper understanding and for new thoughts (learning and creativity)

Four examples of how to use this in your classroom:
1. Start your lessons with a question or a problem (raise curiosity)
2. Encourage and use disagreement as a resource («No answers are wrong»)
3. Lift up different ’voices’, opinions, solutions and discuss them
4. Encourage pupils to think around different alternatives

Dysthe 2015
All forms of teaching can be dialogic or monologic:

The test: Does your teaching open or close for curiosity, questions, further thinking?

Dysthe 2015
II. HOW TO BUILD AND DEVELOP THE POLYPHONIC CLASSROOM
Dialogue based teaching

WHAT DOES IT MEAN FOR PRACTICE?
Is it what good teachers have always done?

WHAT IS NEW?
Systematic approach over long time + "strategies"

• Actively promote pupil’s production of meaning (knowledge) through dialogue and collaboration
• Encourage engagement with other voices
• Value difference and divergence

Polyphony - Participation - Variation

Dysthe 2015
1. TEACHER LED CONVERSATIONS
monologic or dialogic?

Dysthe 2015
Different types of teacher led conversations in the classroom

«Assessment talk»: Inquiry, Response, Evaluation (right or wrong)
• Purpose: the teacher asks questions to check what the pupils know
   The teacher knows the right answer

Learning dialogues
• Purpose:
  1) introduction to new material
  2) work together on new material (plenary or groups)
    – Problem solving
    – Exploration
  3) consolidation of learning

Discussion: (Example: Should begging be forbidden by law?)
– Purpose: convince others through good arguments
– Defend and ’attack’
– Critical testing of arguments

Dysthe 2015
Nystrand’s study of 100 classrooms
«Opening Dialogue» 1997

• IRE- talk dominated – A school culture of right & wrong
• Dialogic talk (‘conversation’)

How to start

• autentic questions
• uptake & high evaluation

• Most important: the teacher builds on the pupil’s answer (uptake)
• If the teacher showed genuine interest in what pupils said, even inautentic questions functioned well

• Who did best on tests?

New studies of Norwegian classrooms: individual work still dominated

What would researchers find at your school?

Dysthe 2015
Example of teacher led dialogue from one of my case studies
(Dysthe: The multivoiced classroom, 1996)

Context: ’Baywater’ high school, California, class 12. Students are Mexican immigrants, Asian immigrants & Black students
Subject: American history
Topic: The class had studied The American Civil War and the situation of the slaves for several weeks
  * Teaching pattern: the pupils were asked to write the last 7 minutes of each lesson. Assignment: ”What does freedom mean to you? Have you ever lost your freedom?”

  * The teacher read the texts at home and picked out quotations which she used to trigger discussion in class

Dysthe 2015
Student quotation: ”Freedom means the ability to do anything anytime a person wants to. But everyone has to obey some rules”

Ann: What do you think about that? Is that true? Authentic question
Flere: Yeah
Kenyatta: No. Cause there’s lot of free who´r not free.
Male pupil: You are not free when you must obey laws.
Ann: No laws? Uptake
Kenyatta: Yeah, freedom means no laws.
Ann: So to you freedom means no laws?. Uptake, high evaluation
Kenyatta: No laws, no rules, no letting nobdy telling you what to do.
Several pupils interrupt and protest.
Ann: OK. Caleb says that´s anachy, and Kenyatta says, well that´s what she keeps saying, that we really aren´t free. fri. If we follow rules, does that mean that we aren´t free? Clarifies differences of opinion, disagreements
Male pupil: No
Kenyatta: But you don´t actually have to follow rules..
Rhonda: So you want to live in a soceity where there is no order and you can walk outside and get killed !
Kenyatta: I´ll be fre, and I´ll be free to be dead.
Rhonda: (upset) We´ve got to have some kind of rules.
Ann: There is a philosopy called anarchism, and a person who really believes this... Dysthe 2015 Ny ’ input’ - minilecture
Writing before talking increases participation

Vygotskij: the importance of language for learning

Dysthe 2015
Kirsten asks for examples of words they have written

- Students: "Stamina, Hitler, demonstrations, war, new, modern, exploration, motorway, industry"

  Teacher: What did you find important? Would you please share the three most important things with us? (authentic)

- Student: War, anger and destruction.

  Teacher: War, anger and destruction. What made you think about those three words? (uptake)

- Student: Well, war – because we see that there is fighting.

  Teacher: Because we see that there is fighting? (uptake)

- Student: Yes

  Teacher: Yes. This is war.

- Student: And we can see that they are angry.

  Teacher: How do you see that they are angry? What in the picture shows you that they are angry? (follow up)

- Student: I am not quite sure ... but as Jonas said earlier...Hitler looks angry

Dysthe 2015
A teaching pattern for participation and learning (in all subjects and at all levels):

1. Individual writing or drawing
2. Sharing in groups of 3-4
3. Reporting and whole class talk

• As introduction to a new topic (we think – we know – we want to know)
• Introduction to class discussion
• «What have we learnt?» 'Consolidation'

Dysthe 2015
Conclusion of a lesson or a project – dialogue to consolidate learning

• What have we done?
• What have we learnt?
• Pupils’ interpretation of the period/day or teacher summary?

Several research studies of Norwegian classrooms show that this rarely happens, even though teachers know the importance.

What would researchers find if they study your classroom or school?

Dysthe 2015
THINK, WRITE, SHARE

How can you improve your learning dialogues in your own classrooms (school)?
Which ideas can you use?

Share

Dysthe 2015
2. DIALOGiC INTERACTION IN STUDENT GROUPS

Dysthe 2015
Two types of pupil led groups

- Short group sequences as part of structured learning processes – usually ending with a teacher led plenary session

- Workshop groups (where pupils work together to solve an assignment or a project in different subjects) Written or oral reports
Polyphony through short group assignments
The groups report immediately in teacher led plenary

Dysthe 2015
Project assignment
Groups solve a problem through collaboration + product

- Short time
- Brainstorming
- Explorative
- Different proposals
- Argumentation
- Problem solving discussion
- Consensus
- Product

Dysthe 2015
Example of group conversation as an everyday teaching method

**Teaching addition of fractions in a Japanese class**

- The pupils get the task to add $\frac{1}{2}$ and $\frac{1}{3}$. There are three different suggestions of how to do this.

- The class votes.

- Each group discusses *the reasons* for their way of solving the problem.

- Confrontation between different solutions
  - No answers are labeled wrong! All the voices contribute and are important because they give opportunity for discussion.
  - This creates engagement and interest for *understanding* why one way of doing it gives the correct answer.

Dysthe 2015
“THINKING TOGETHER”
Mercer: the most prominent dialogue pedagogue in Europe

- Research studies of children’s oral culture in classrooms
  - Theoretical basis: Vygotskij & Bakhtin
    - To become an educated person: to use language in special ways
  How to use language for learning and teaching in the classroom to make pupils think together
  How dialogue can foster shared meaning making and give pupils tools for intellectual activities
  - Research findings: 3 types of talk among children in groups: disputational, cumulative, explorative talk
  - Consensus vs disagreement: Mercer chooses to let the groups work towards consensus because it may give them a deeper engagement in the problems than just agreeing to disagree

Dysthe 2015
What is needed to make collaborative groups work?

«Pupils must learn how to work together, talk together, think together»

• The teacher models dialogic values (i.e. listen, show respect)
• The groups discuss and decide common rules for their group:
  – “We share ideas and listen to one another”
  – ”We speak one at a time”
  – ”We respect one another’s opinions”
  – ”We give reasons that explain our ideas”
  – ”When we disagree, we ask why.
  – ”We try to agree in the end”

• The groups work towards consensus

Dialogue and the development of childrens’ thinking (Mercer & Littleton 2007)

Dysthe 2015
”Deliberative talk” – designed to foster democratic citizenship

Habermas inspired
Advocated by T. Englund (professor in Ørebro, Sweden)

• Student group discussions of topical issues
  – Phase 1: polyphonic, productive, disagreements
  – Phase 2: deliberative, weighing arguments
  – Phase 3: trying to reach concensus

Takes place regularly throughout the year
Digital tools can promote a polyphonic learning community

Wegerif collaborated with Mercer about projects in primary school.

What is the role of technology?

“Dialogic space”

Not primarily a tool for learning but «technology expands and deepens the dialogical space by bringing in more voices»

Wegerif, R. (2007) *Dialogic education and technology. Expanding the space of learning*

Dysthe 2015
3. What role does dialogue play in writing and feedback in the polyphonic classroom?
Where in the writing process is polyphony a resource?

- Getting started
- Revision
- Writing a first draft
- Feedback (response)
- Assessment

Dysthe 2015
Peer response in groups? In class? Netbased? (‘polyphonic feedback’)
Example from one of my case studies:

Writing as a tool for learning
Dialogue through writing and talking

• ’Role writing’ in social science: Topic: Criminality
  2 variations:
  1. Divide class in 3, pupils write one text each, different in each group
  2. Each pupil writes 3 texts, from the point of view of 3 different persons

Assignment:
  a. You are a young person who has committed a crime
  b. You are one of the parents of this youth
  c. You are a member of society who is appalled by the increased criminality in the neigbourhood

• READ ALOUD
• DISCUSS IN GROUPS

Dysthe 2015
«It is the teacher’s responsibility to give the students the tools they need to succeed»

- Example from one of my classroom studies: A multicultural Advanced Placement English Literature class in California

**Context:** Paula (coming from a disadvantaged school background: «I want to quit this class. I cannot talk like them»

**Teacher:** «The tools she and all students need to do well in school can only be developed within the class community – and I am responsible»

**Change:** from free to *structured* student activities.

She modelled and taught them for example how to:

- work with a novel or poem,
- discuss in groups,
- use quotes to exemplify (underpin) their opinion of literature,
- write a critical essay,
- give feedback to fellow students,
- use feedback to improve text

**Rules for interaction**

*Strong structure with great freedom*

«Opportunity spaces for dialogic pedagogy in a test oriented school» (Dysthe 2012)

Dysthe 2015
If the teacher is the key to a polyphonic classroom - who is responsible for teaching the teachers?

My traditional village classroom

My grandchilden´s classroom

Dysthe 2015
A final writing task: WRITE DOWN ONE QUESTION YOU WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS OR HEAR MORE ABOUT
Literature 2